

Mid-term Evaluation of the Project

“Support rural communities to enhance self-help protection against impact of climate change”

Phase III

Main Partners: Mozambique Red Cross Society (CVM) German Red Cross (GRC)

Donor: Ministry of Economic Cooperation and Development (BMZ-SSF)

(2017-2020)

BMZ-PN: 2017 2600 9/DRK0002

Final report

Evaluator: Dr. Ines Freier

December, 19th 2019



LIST OF ACRONYMS

BFFS	Belgian Fund for Food Security
BSC	Balanced Score Card
CCGO	Conselho de Coordenação de Gestão de Calamidades
CENOI	Centro Nacional Operacional de Emergencia
CVM	Cruz Vermelha do Moçambique (Mozambican Red Cross)
DPM	Direção de Prevenção e Mitigação
DRM	Disaster Risk Management
DRR	Disaster Risk Reduction
FDD	Fundo de Desenvolvimento Distrital
GRC	German Red Cross
HDI	Human Development Index
HO	Head Office
HR	Human Resources
IFRC	International Federation of Red Cross and Red Crescent Societies
IGA	Income Generating Activities
IMF	International Monetary Fund
INGC	Instituto Nacional para a Gestão de Catastrofes
I-NGO	International Non Government Organization
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MFI	Microfinance Institution
MIS	Monitoring and Information System
MZN	Mozambican Metical
PAM	Programa Alimentar Mundial (World Food Program)
PARPA	Plan de Ação para a Redução da Pobreza Absoluta
PPD	Programa de Preparação aos Disastres
SDAE	Serviço Distrital de Actividades Economicas
SDPI	Serviço Distrital de Planeamento e Infraestruturas
SETSAN	Secretario Tecnico para a Segurança Alimentar e a Nutrição
UNAPROC	Unidade de Proteção Civil
VCA	Vulnerability Community Assessment

Disclaimer

This report has been prepared by an independent consultant and is a product of German Red Cross. The findings and conclusions expressed herein do not necessarily reflect the views of the German Red Cross (GRC) and the Cruz Vermelha Mocambique (CVM).

Acknowledgements

The evaluator of the Mid-term Evaluation of the Project would like to thank all involved persons in Mocambique and Germany for their support. Particularly I would like to thank the interview partners in Gaza Province for their time for the interviews and the open discussions. I would especially like to thank Mr. Boavida Chambal from CVM Headquarters in Maputo for accompanying the evaluation mission despite his full agenda, sharing his insights into the Province of Gaza, the DRM system in Mocambique and the work of CVM and bringing some issues forward.

I would also like to thank Hanne Roden, Head of GRC office in Maputo, Hildi Schaetti GRC delegate in Gaza Province and the project staff, EU-volunteer and CVM functionaries in Gaza province for the excellent planning and management of the mission logistics and sharing their insights into the project work. I will always remember the project driver Mr. Cumaio for his kindness and safe driving.

Likewise, I would like to thank the project manager of GRC headquarters in Berlin Florian Neubauer for his support and guidance in the Mid-term evaluation.

Short biography of the consultant

Dr. Ines Freier has more than 15 years of experience in planning and evaluation of environmental projects in developing countries. Among the assignments were evaluations of BMZ projects using a theory of change approach (DAC criteria for evaluation, EU log frame and GIZ capacity works). Methods of evaluation included literature reviews, personal and telephone interviews, e-mail questionnaires and visits to projects consulting beneficiaries of the project and advising to governments and stakeholders. Now, my working experience covers Latin America, Africa and Asia. Several of the assignments focused on climate change adaptation issues and capacity building. As a former Volunteer of the East German Red Cross (rescue swimmer) I was very curious how Red Cross structures work in different countries of the world.

Content

1. SUMMARY	5
2. INTRODUCTION	8
2.1. BACKGROUND - SITUATION OF DRM IN MOÇAMBIQUE.....	8
2.2. PURPOSE AND SCOPE OF THE EVALUATION.....	9
2.3. TARGET AUDIENCE OF THE EVALUATION.....	10
3. EVALUATION DESIGN AND METHODS	11
4. RESULTS OF THE MID-TERM EVALUATION	13
4.1 EVALUATION SCOPE.....	13
4.2 RELEVANCE AND COHERENCE.....	13
4.3. EFFECTIVENESS	14
4.4. EFFICIENCY.....	18
4.5. IMPACT.....	19
4.6. GENDER	21
4.7. SUSTAINABILITY & CONNECTEDNESS.....	22
5. CONCLUSIONS	27
6 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE PROJECT TEAM	29
7. ANNEX	30

1. Summary

The *main objective of the project* is to improve the capacities of relevant state institutions and the Mozambican Red Cross (CVM) at the provincial and local levels to support communities in disaster preparedness and adaptation to climate change. The project follows a 3-level-approach (micro, meso and macro-level), whereas the focus of this project phase is on the meso and macro levels.

The expected results are:

- Improved resilience and independence in disaster risk management of the affected target communities against recurring natural hazards (micro level)

The 23 trained committees work independently and implement the projects of their village development plans independently.

- Improved expertise and development of CVM internal structures to improve disaster management (meso level)

The competence and resources of CVM's local structures are improved to support rural communities and public administration in DRR/DM.

- Improved capacity & equipment of the INGC in the implementation of the National Disaster Management Strategy (macro level).

The capacity and equipment of public administration institutions responsible for disaster management and coordination at district and local levels have been improved in order to implement the National Disaster Relief Strategy (in particular the "last mile").

Relevance and Coherence

The project objective - to support DRM structures in the province of Gaza- is still valid in phase 3 of the project because structures of CVM and district administration as well as the local committees for disaster risk reduction are still weak. Over the last two years, drought has created new challenges to DRM structures in the province of Gaza. For example: In the district of Guijá, more than 50% of the population is food insecure in the upcoming rainy season. At the micro level, pilot projects for introducing drought resistant breeds, irrigation technologies and better storage facilities are urgently needed for facing the water shortage in the communities.

This is why the project objective to improve the capacities of CVM and relevant state institutions to support communities in DRM is still valid. The project is also coherent with the priorities of the respective district and province authorities and other humanitarian actors.

CVM is a player in the field of DRM in Gaza province due to its local offices and its groups of volunteers in the communities. This project as all CVM projects is implemented by professional staff. CVM lacks a comprehensive concept of how to involve volunteers in projects and how to develop and support volunteer groups in the communities and district commissions.

Effectiveness

The project will achieve its overall objective if the indicators for the objective will be adapted. They need to reflect the role of CVM volunteers in the communities and the strengths of CVM.

The outputs at the micro and macro level are attainable during the last 10 months of project activities and contribute to the overall objective of the project. The outputs at the meso level need to be modified to be feasible and to contribute to the project objective.

The theory of change is weak for the link between outputs and outcome at the meso level. The planned activities and outputs at the meso level are either not feasible during the next 10 months or not very well suited to effectively contribute to the project goal.

The weak theory of change reflects at three levels:

- 1) micro level: role of CVM volunteers in the committees and communities and in the district capitals, how to create groups of CVM volunteers and integrate a large number of volunteers into the committees within the remaining 10 months of project activities?
- 2) meso level: the relationship between the project structures and the structures of CVM in the province, how to create sustainable structures at the district level and provincial levels
- 3) How to fund the three district and the provincial offices in the long run.

This lack of concept hampers the implementation of meso level activities and the attainment of the project objective. The meso level is in the focus of the current phase 3, so adjustments of indicators for outputs and respective project activities need to be made. These adjustments are also reflected in the indicators for the specific project objective.

Impacts

The project has been successful to generate impacts on the community level strengthening the target group's resilience to extreme events. At the community level, the evaluation has focused on the work of the DRM committees to assess impacts of the project because the project has very widespread activities in water and sanitation, food security and community development projects. Evaluating the impact of all these activities would have been too costly. Project staff and stakeholders see the creation of the local committees as the biggest success of the project.

The project has very likely achieved its intended impacts to contribute to strengthen the resilience of the communities. In general, the playing field for DRM projects in Gaza province is very favorable due to the learning capacities of the population and the interest of the state in effectively responding to DRM. The project activities support those adaptation capacities. In all interviews with representatives

of the communities as well as with representatives of the district and provincial governments, the respondents have shown a high awareness of disasters.

The project has been less successful to improve the capacities of CVM structures at the district level to respond to disasters due to delays in activities. **CVM volunteers are members of the local committees in the communities but do not conduct much activities as CVM.** The District Commissions of all three Districts reported activities, mainly supervising the project activities and supporting procurement processes asking local traders for offers. The last activity of volunteers was providing first aid during the elections in October 2019. **Members of the District commissions relate their low level of activities to the lack of funding.** The question of generating funds has been tight to the elections of CVM district committees which are delayed. CVM at the national level and provincial levels have decided about an assembly instead of elections in February 2020.

Lists of members in the district exist but membership fees are not systematically collected. This is why funding of small activities is a challenge. A yearly plan of activities at the provincial and district levels could not be revealed during the evaluation. The project supported the creation of 6 CVM Youth groups in the three districts.

The project has generated the expected impacts at the macro level to support governmental institutions at the level of the Province and the districts.

Sustainability

The sustainability of the project results is likely at the micro level during the next years, unlikely to occur at the meso level and likely at the macro level if external conditions will further improve. At the micro level, the DRM committees in the communities will continue to work because they have to deal with drought as a new type of disaster. They might even drop the simulation exercise but they know secure areas and roads for evacuation in case of strong winds and inundations. Community members will keep on implementing activities for drought resistant technologies because they need them.

At the meso level, CVM volunteers at the community level and in the district and provincial capitals will continue their ad-hoc activities without a solid financial base. How the operational costs of the two new offices and the warehouse are covered after the closure of the project remains open.

INGC will continue its activities probably receiving support from other projects in drought prone areas. It is likely that the districts will allocate some funds for DRM in the budget of the different Departments as it is planned in the National Programme for Disaster Risk Reduction.

Efficiency

The activities are mainly cost efficient. Some project activities have been delayed due to the change of DRC delegate, provincial secretary and project staff in the beginning of phase 3. The project has sufficient human resources to implement all project activities. The project staff is able to implement the activities however some staff members are new in the positions and need further training on the job and in training courses. The project-set up is adequate however roles and responsibilities between the project and CVM structures in the province have not been agreed upon in the beginning of the project (Phase 1). This hampers the smooth running of activities where a pro-active role of CVM is required like organising district commission elections before revenue generation activities could start. After the corruption incident in phase 2 of the project, the internal M+E system is in place and works.

Gender

The project staff is more aware of gender issues because they received a gender training. Volunteers in the committees are not aware how gender imbalances of power could impact the response to disasters. Local DRM committees consist mainly of women. Women in the Gaza province need to have permission of men to relocate in case of an emergency which leads to a slower response to disasters and higher losses. This is why the project team should raise awareness that local DRM committees have the authority to decide upon the response to disasters of the whole community.

Recommendations

The project needs to focus more on the meso level in order to achieve its objective as it was planned for phase 3. This means developing the capacities of CVM at the local and provincial levels relying on its strengths: Volunteers providing „First Aid“ combined with DRM.

The following recommendations are given to the project:

Adjust indicators for the objective of the project:

1. Indicator: 90% of the 300 volunteers trained in first aid and having received a first aid kit are integrated in the committees at the local level.
2. Indicator: 15 youth brigades (CVM Youth) are founded and supported in the three district (Chokwe, Guija and Chibuto) and have a programme for their work.

Adjust indicator for the micro level:

New Indicator: 50% of the communities implement new drought resistant technologies for agriculture (as pilot projects).

Adjust outputs / indicators and related activities for meso level:

Output 2.1. staff receives training to increase their professional capabilities based on their individual training needs:

- update list of training needs, search for trainings suited to the needs of CVM professionals and staff

Output 2.2. Develop system for membership development and training:

- member database for the three districts to be able to reach out to volunteers and to collect member fees,
- system for providing first aid / DRM training to volunteers,
- plan for work with CVM Jovens (list of activities, training of group leaders) and implement it

Output 2.3. Revenue generating activities

- Fundraising (levantar pequenos fondos) volunteers shall learn to develop and implement their own fundraising activities
- Support volunteers in the three districts of Gaza to develop their own working programme and to conduct fundraising to finance those activities

Develop ownership of CVM:

within first Quarter of 2020 talk with CVM HQ about:

- the use of the two newly built offices as examples for applying DRM into spatial planning and as strategic assets for future disaster response,
- financing CVM staff and infrastructure (warehouse) in Gaza after the closure of the the project,
- the use of rents paid by the project for the use of CVM district offices to the CVM Office of Gaza province; how the rents can be disbursed to allow repairing the district offices and financing volunteers activities at the district level.

Improve administrative processes for procurement within CVM:

Discuss with CVM headquarters and GRC:

- CVM HQ's compliance with the set timeframe for deciding about procurements planned by the project (decision within 7 days because offers expire after 7 days),
- feasibility of contracts for procurement with suppliers,
- ensuring that administrative processes take place when responsible staff is on medical and annual leave.

Gender

- ensure further gender training of staff and volunteers
- sensitizing communities that committees decide about actions during an emergency and women do not have to consult their husband working outside the communities to ask for permission